

SCIENCES PASTORALES

Le vieillissement

PASTORAL SCIENCES

Aging

Faculté des sciences humaines / Faculty of Human Sciences

UNIVERSITÉ SAINT-PAUL / SAINT PAUL UNIVERSITY

VOL. 24 n° 2
Automne / Fall 2005

Happy but Exhausted? Work-related Psychological Health among Clergy

LESLIE J FRANCIS*

University of Wales, Bangor, UK

PETER KALDOR**

NCLS Research, Sydney, Australia

MANDY ROBBINS***

University of Wales, Bangor, UK

and

KEITH CASTLE****

NCLS Research, Sydney, Australia

Abstract

A sample of 6,680 clergy from Australia, England and New Zealand completed two indices of work-related psychological health, the **Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry (negative affect)** and the **Satisfaction in Ministry Scale (positive affect)**, together with the abbreviated form of the Eysenck Personality Questionnaire Revised. The data supported the internal consistency reliability of the two indices of work-related psychological health and demonstrated the power of Eysenck's

* The Rev'd Leslie J. Francis is the Director of the Welsh National Centre for Religious Education and Professor of Practical Theology, University of Wales. Correspondence can be sent to: Welsh National Centre for Religious Education, University of Wales, Meirion, Normal Site, Bangor, Gwynedd LL57 2PX Wales, UK. Email: l.j.francis@bangor.ac.uk. Website: www.bangor.ac.uk/rs/pt

** Peter Kaldor is a Research Fellow with NCLS Research, Sydney, New South Wales, Australia.

*** Mandy Robbins is a Teaching and Research Fellow, Welsh National Centre for Religious Education, University of Wales, Bangor, UK.

**** Keith Castle is the Director of NCLS Research, Sydney, New South Wales, Australia.

dimensional model of personality to predict those clergy most likely to be susceptible to high levels of emotional exhaustion and to low levels of satisfaction in ministry. These findings suggest that routine personality testing could be employed to identify clergy most vulnerable to the stresses of ministry in a rapidly changing world and to promote better work-related psychological health among clergy.

Résumé

Un échantillon de 6,680 membres du clergé d'Australie, d'Angleterre et de Nouvelle Zélande s'est vu administrer deux indicateurs de la santé psychologique relative au travail, à savoir l'échelle d'épuisement émotionnel dans l'exercice du ministère (affect négatif) et l'échelle de satisfaction dans l'exercice du ministère (affect positif), ainsi que la forme abrégée et révisée du questionnaire de personnalité d'Eysenck. Les données confirment la fiabilité de consistance interne des deux indicateurs de la santé psychologique liée au travail et démontrent la puissance du modèle dimensionnel de la personnalité d'Eysenck pour prédire ceux qui, parmi les membres du clergé, se situent très probablement à des niveaux élevés d'épuisement émotionnel et ceux destinés à des niveaux bas de satisfaction dans le ministère exercé. Ces résultats suggèrent qu'une évaluation courante de la personnalité peut être utilisée pour identifier les membres du clergé les plus vulnérables aux éléments stressants du ministère dans un monde qui change rapidement et pour promouvoir chez eux une meilleure santé psychologique liée à leur travail.

Research concerning the work-related psychological health of clergy might be of interest to practical theologians and to church leaders for two quite different reasons, one pastoral and one pragmatic. The pastoral reason is based on an analysis of the nature of the very task clergy are called to fulfil. Those who exercise care and concern for others clearly deserve such care and concern shown for themselves. The pragmatic reason is based on an analysis of the costs to the church of clergy ill-health. Clergy are expensive to train and consequently exits from the profession into secular employment or into early retirement on health grounds are clearly an inefficient use of scarce resources. In spite of such pastoral and pragmatic reasons for concern, **there is a considerable dearth of significant research into the work-related psychological health of the clergy.**

They can say this in 2005!

Existing research in the area follows two broad traditions, and, on face value, these two traditions seems to offer very different images of the clerical profession. One tradition focuses on the positive aspects of work-related psychological health and speaks in terms of constructs like ministerial job satisfaction. The other tradition focuses on the negative aspects of work-related psychological health and speaks in terms of constructs like stress, burnout, and emotional exhaustion. The first tradition generally finds that clergy enjoy considerable positive affect from their ministry. The second tradition generally finds that clergy suffer considerable negative affect from their ministry. **These two apparently contradictory findings are, however, fully in accord with Bradburn's (1969) established model of balanced affect, according to which positive affect and negative affect are not opposite ends of a single continuum, but two separate continua.** According to this model it is totally reasonable for individual clergy to experience at one and the same time high levels of positive affect (job satisfaction) and high levels of negative affect (emotional exhaustion). According to this model of balanced affect, **warning signs of poor work-related psychological health occur when high levels of negative affect (emotional exhaustion) coincide with low levels of positive affect (job satisfaction).** The two traditions of research concerned with positive affect and job satisfaction among clergy, and concerned with negative affect, stress, burnout, and emotional exhaustion among clergy will now be reviewed in turn.

Looking first at research concerned with positive affect among clergy, several studies have compared the levels of job satisfaction reported by clergy and by members of other professional groups. For example, **Sales and House (1971) found that clergymen, along with scientists and university teachers, reported the highest levels of job satisfaction.** More recently, Rose (1999), using data from the British Household Panel Survey, found that clergy were showing the second highest level of satisfaction with their job, with only medical secretaries scoring higher.

A survey commissioned by the Archbishops' Council (2001) for the Clergy Stipends Review Group included a single item on job satisfaction completed by 6,295 stipendiary clergy and lay workers in the Church of England (described as a 'nearly two-thirds' response rate). In response to the question 'I would rate my job satisfaction currently as', 25% chose excellent, 49% good, 18% adequate, 6% poor, and 1% very poor. The remaining 1% left the question unanswered. The proportions of clergy who rated their level of job satisfaction as poor or very poor ranged from 3% in the diocese of Ely to 22% in the diocese of Oxford.

In his questionnaire survey completed by 372 Church of England clergymen, Fletcher (1990) assessed job satisfaction by a simple multi-choice item. In response to this item: 53% of the clergy reported that 'I feel it is a worthwhile job and would not dream of doing anything else'; 20% reported that 'I feel it is a worthwhile job, but I wouldn't mind doing something else for a living'; 8% reported that 'I feel it is a worthwhile job, but I can think of lots of other jobs I would like to do'; 14% reported that 'I feel it is a worthwhile job, but the Church should look seriously at alternatives to full-time ministry'; 1% reported that 'I feel it is a worthwhile job, but it's not for me and I would get out if I could'; and 2% reported that 'I think it is a worthwhile job, but I dislike it very much and would clearly love to do something else'. Reflecting on these responses, Fletcher (1990:28) concluded that 'if this item is scored on a 1-6 scale (where 6 = very dissatisfied) the mean score for the clergy is 1.95 and constitutes very high satisfaction levels'. Fletcher's multiple-choice item has not been re-used by subsequent research and may be difficult to justify in terms of the six items chosen to reflect gradations in clergy job satisfaction.

Glass (1976) developed an instrument specifically designed to assess job-satisfaction among the clergy: the Ministerial Job Satisfaction Scale (MJSS). The development of this measure involved three main steps. The first step identified eight component aspects of ministry which might affect job satisfaction, defined as: traditional functions, including administration, preaching, priestly roles, teaching, counselling, visiting, and professional and continuing study; relationships and support, including contact with supervisors and denominational superiors, fellow ministers, congregation, family, and people in general; denominational involvement, including governing bodies and placing mechanisms; ecumenical involvement, including ministerial associations and cooperative projects; community involvement, including community social action programmes and participation in civic clubs; working conditions, including hours, environment and resourcing; wages and benefits, including salary, vacations, retirement provisions, and opportunities for advancement; and intrinsic aspects of ministry, including appropriateness of training, and utilisation of skills and abilities.

The second step constructed 206 Likert-type items designed to cover all the aspects of the minister's job. A review panel, invited to assess the items for face validity, clarity, relative difficulty and redundancy, reduced the pool of items to 102.

The third step analysed the responses of 144 Methodist ministers to these 102 items. Item analysis was used to select the 25 items best

able to discriminate between high scorers and low scorers. The items selected by this method concentrated particularly on three of the eight component aspects of ministry identified by the original conceptual analysis: relationships and support, intrinsic aspects of ministry and denominational involvement. On the other hand, wages and benefits and many of the traditional functions of ministry (preaching, priestly roles, teaching, counselling and visiting) were seen to be peripheral to the overall assessment of satisfaction with ministry.

Turton and Francis (2002) proposed a revised form of Glass' Ministerial Job Satisfaction Scale by modifying the items to make them more accessible to Anglican clergy in England. This revised scale was mailed as part of a larger battery of tests to a random sample of 2,000 male stipendiary parochial clergy working in the Church of England with at least five years experience since ordination to the diaconate. Just 33 of the questionnaires were not successfully delivered, and completed questionnaires were received from 1,276 of the recipients, making an overall response rate of 64.9%. The 23 items of this revised instrument were each assessed a five point Likert scale: agree strongly (5), agree (4), not certain (3), disagree (2), and disagree strongly (1). Scale scores could, therefore, range from 23 to 115. Turton and Francis' data reported a mean score of 79.9 for clergy in their forties, rising to a mean score of 83.4 for clergy in their sixties. The majority of clergy were reporting a high level of job satisfaction.

While Turton and Francis' revised Ministerial Job Satisfaction Scale is appropriate for use among Anglican clergy, many of the items have been too closely shaped for an episcopal church to facilitate comparisons between different denominations.

Turning now to research concerned with negative affect among clergy, several studies have employed the Maslach Burnout Inventory (MASLACH & JACKSON, 1986) among clergy, including Warner and Carter (1984), Strümper and Bands (1996), Rodgeron and Piedmont (1998), Stanton-Rich and Iso-Ahola (1998), and Francis and Rutledge (2000). These studies are of interest primarily for the way in which they explore the correlates of burnout rather than for concern with the incidence of burnout.

Warner and Carter (1984) administered the Maslach Burnout Inventory to 33 pastors, to 28 pastors' wives, to 64 non-pastoral males, and 64 non-pastoral females. They found that it was the pastors' wives who scored highest on the emotional exhaustion subscale, whereas the pastors themselves did not score significantly higher than the non-pastors. They argued that this finding was related to the age of the pastors

in their sample on the following grounds.

Pastors who have been in ministry longer will have developed coping techniques to prevent or reduce emotional exhaustion. Those who have not developed adequate coping techniques would be expected to have left the ministry many years prior (WARNER & CARTER, 1984, p. 130).

Strümpfer and Bands (1996) administered the Maslach Burnout Inventory to 110 South African Anglican priests. They found that burnout correlated significantly with person-role conflict and with quantitative workload. Comparing the emotional exhaustion scores of these clergy with the test manual Strümpfer and Bands (1996:71) state that 'it cannot be concluded that the present sample suffered from unusual levels of burnout.

Stanton-Rich and Iso-Ahola (1998) administered the Maslach Burnout Inventory to 241 active clergy in the Western North Carolina Conference of the United Methodist Church. They found that leisure behaviour and leisure satisfaction were inversely related to burnout.

Rodgers and Piedmont (1998) administered the Maslach Burnout Inventory to 252 full-time pastors serving congregations in the American Baptist Churches of the United States of America, together with measures of personality, religious problem solving and work-related perceptions. They found that the model of religious problem solving proposed by Pargament, Kennell, Hathaway, Grevengoed, Newman and Jones (1988) added a small but significant prediction regarding clergy scores on two of three subscales of burnout: depersonalisation and personal accomplishment.

Francis and Rutledge (2000) administered a modified form of the Maslach Burnout Inventory to 1,071 Anglican clergymen in England in order to test whether rural clergy were under greater stress than clergy serving in non-rural areas. They found that there were no differences in levels of emotional exhaustion or depersonalisation experienced by clergy working in rural and in non-rural areas.

The usefulness of the Maslach Burnout Inventory for studies among clergy has, however, been questioned on both conceptual and empirical grounds. Conceptually, Francis and Rutledge (2000) questioned the appropriateness of some of the individual items in relation to the way in which clergy care to speak of those within their pastoral charge. Empirically, Hills, Francis and Rutledge (2004) raised doubts about the factor structure of the instrument.

A measure of stress specifically shaped for clergy was proposed by

Oswald (1991) as a diagnostic tool. There is, however, no evidence of the psychometric properties of this instrument having been explored in the scientific literature. In their critique of Oswald's instrument, Francis, Kaldor, Shevlin and Lewis (2004) identified a core set of items that accessed the concept of emotional exhaustion in a way appropriate for clergy. Then they generated a set of new items to augment Oswald's items and to form the new Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry (SEEM).

Francis, Kaldor, Shevlin and Lewis (2004) administered the Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry to a sample of 4,370 Australian clergy who participated in the National Church Life Survey. This 11-item measure of emotional exhaustion was found to be unidimensional using confirmatory factor analysis. The scale was demonstrated to be reliable ($\alpha = .883$) and construct validity was supported by means of correlations with other survey questions. The data demonstrated that emotional exhaustion was more prevalent among younger clergy than among older clergy, and more prevalent among clergy associated with some denominations than with other denominations.

The key question regarding individual differences in both positive affect and negative affect concerns the importance of internal factors (like personality) before considering the importance of external factors (like environment). More specifically the question concerns the extent to which the susceptibility of individual clergy to high levels of emotional exhaustion and to low levels of job satisfaction can be predicted from information about their personality. Among the contemporary range of personality theories, Eysenck's three dimensional model of personality appears to be well established in predicting individual differences in positive and negative affect (FRANCIS, BROWN, LESTER & PHILIPCHALK, 1998).

In its most recent form Eysenck's model of personality argues that individual differences can be most adequately and economically summarised in terms of three major orthogonal dimensions which he characterises as follows (EYSENCK & EYSENCK, 1991). The two poles of the first dimension are labelled as introversion and extraversion. The two poles of the second dimension are labelled as stability and neuroticism. The two poles of the third dimension are labelled as tenderminded and toughminded (psychoticism). The instruments also contain a lie scale.

Eysenck's extraversion scales measure sociability and impulsivity. The opposite of extraversion is introversion. The high scorer on the extraversion scale is characterised by the test manual (EYSENCK &

EYSENCK, 1975) as a sociable individual, who likes parties, has many friends, needs to have people to talk to and prefers meeting people to reading or studying alone. The typical extravert craves excitement, takes chances, acts on the spur of the moment, is carefree, easy-going, optimistic, and likes to 'laugh and be merry'.

Eysenck's neuroticism scales measure emotional lability and over-reactivity. The opposite of neuroticism is emotional stability. The high scorer on the neuroticism scale is characterised by the test manual as an anxious, worrying individual, who is moody and frequently depressed, likely to sleep badly and to suffer from various psychosomatic disorders. Eysenck and Eysenck (1975) suggest that if the high scorer on the neuroticism scale 'has to be described in one word, one might say that he was a *worrier*; his main characteristic is a constant preoccupation with things that might go wrong, and with a strong emotional reaction of anxiety to these thoughts.'

Eysenck's psychoticism scales identify the underlying personality traits which at one extreme define psychotic mental disorders. The opposite of psychoticism is normal personality. The high scorer on the psychoticism scale is characterised by Eysenck and Eysenck (1976), in their study of psychoticism as a dimension of personality, as being 'cold, impersonal, hostile, lacking in sympathy, unfriendly, untrustful, odd, unemotional, unhelpful, lacking in insight, strange, with paranoid ideas that people were against him.'

Lie scales were originally introduced into personality inventories to detect the tendency of some respondents to 'fake good' and so to distort the resultant personality scores (O'DONOVAN, 1969). The notion of the lie scale has not, however, remained as simple as that, and their continued use has resulted in them being interpreted as a personality measure in their own right (FURNHAM, 1986; MCCRAE & COSTA, 1983).

Against this background, the aim of the present study is threefold. The first aim is to test a further modification of the Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry in order to ensure its appropriateness for international and interdenominational studies. The second aim is to develop a comparable measure of job satisfaction, the Satisfaction in Ministry Scale (SIMS). The third aim is to test the extent to which individual differences in these two aspects of work-related psychological health among the clergy (emotional exhaustion in ministry and satisfaction in ministry) can be predicted from a standard measure of personality.

Method

Participants

The data were collected as part of the 2001 National Church Life Survey carried out by NCLS Research and partner organisations in Australia, England and New Zealand. In parallel with an attender survey, the senior minister/pastor/priest in each congregation was invited to complete a leader survey. Useful replies for the present analysis were received from 6,680 leaders across the three nations. The sample comprised 5,496 men and 1,143 women; 3,903 from Australia, 2,163 from England, and 614 from New Zealand. Of the total respondents, 102 were under the age of thirty, 893 were in their thirties, 1,934 were in their forties, 2,234 were in their fifties, 1,248 were in their sixties, and 250 were aged seventy or over. A small number of respondents chose not to answer the questions on sex and age. A wide range of denominations were represented in all three countries.

Measures

Emotional exhaustion in ministry was assessed by a revision of the Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry (SEEM) proposed by Francis, Kaldor, Shevlin and Lewis (2004). The revised instrument comprises 11 items, each assessed on a five-point scale: agree strongly (5), agree (4), not certain (3), disagree (2), and disagree strongly (1). The revised instrument differs from the original version in two ways. The rating scale was reduced from 6 to 5 categories to permit a neutral central response. Some of the items were re-shaped to reflect the fully international and ecumenical nature of the project. Example items include: 'I feel drained in fulfilling my functions here', and 'I am less patient with people here than I used to be'.

Satisfaction in ministry was assessed by a new instrument, the Satisfaction in Ministry Scale (SIMS). This instrument was designed to comprise 11 items, each assessed on a five-point scale: agree strongly (5), agree (4), not certain (3), disagree (2), and disagree strongly (1). Example items included: 'I feel very positive about my ministry here', and 'I am really glad that I entered the ministry'.

The 11 items from the Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry and the 11 items from the Satisfaction in Ministry Scale were presented alternatively and prefaced by the simple description: 'The following questions are about how you feel working in your present congregation.'

Personality was assessed by the abbreviated form of the Eysenck Personality Questionnaire Revised (EPQR-A) proposed by Francis,

Brown and Philipchalk (1992) and further revised by Francis, Robbins, Loudon and Haley (2001). This instrument comprises three six-item scales of extraversion, neuroticism, and psychoticism, together with a six-item lie scale. Each item is assessed on a two-point scale: yes (1) and no (2).

Procedure

The measures of emotional exhaustion in ministry (SEEM) and satisfaction in ministry (SIMS) were administered to all participants within the three nations. The measure of personality (EPQR-A) was administered only to a subset of the participants in Australia and New Zealand, providing data from 2045 men and 274 women.

Results

Tables 1 and 2 present the scale properties of the Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry (SEEM) and the Satisfaction in Ministry Scale (SIMS) in terms of the item rest-of-test correlations, the factor loadings on the first factor proposed by principal component analysis (unrotated) and the item endorsement, together with the alpha coefficient and the proportion of variance accounted for by the first factor.

Table 1 Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry (SEEM): scale properties

	r	factor loading	%
I feel drained in fulfilling my functions here	0.5987	0.6978	29.0
Fatigue and irritation are part of my daily experience	0.6359	0.7305	26.8
I am invaded by sadness I can't explain	0.5417	0.6441	7.3
I am feeling negative or cynical about the people with whom I work	0.6000	0.6987	7.3
I always have enthusiasm for my work*	0.4254	0.5237	68.0
My humour has a cynical and biting tone	0.3852	0.4814	7.6
I find myself spending less and less time with attenders	0.3727	0.4636	17.1
I have been discouraged by the lack of personal support here	0.5466	0.6520	12.4
I find myself frustrated in my attempts to accomplish tasks important to me	0.5905	0.6888	31.4
I am less patient with people here than I used to be	0.5341	0.6395	16.1
I am becoming less flexible in my dealings with attenders	0.5208	0.6195	6.8
alpha/percent of variance	0.8436	39.4%	

* Note: this item has been reverse coded to compute the correlations and factor loadings, but not the percentage endorsement.

Table 2 Satisfaction in Ministry Scale (SIMS): scale properties

	r	factor loading	%
I have accomplished many worthwhile things in my ministry here	0.4715	0.5684	79.6
I gain a lot of personal satisfaction from working with people here	0.5817	0.6875	83.3
I deal very effectively with the problems of the people here	0.4551	0.5439	54.9
I can easily understand how the people here feel about things	0.3100	0.3870	66.8
I feel very positive about my ministry here	0.6851	0.7800	79.4
I feel that my pastoral ministry has a positive influence on people's lives	0.4729	0.5635	88.2
I feel that my teaching ministry has a positive influence on people's faith	0.4051	0.4957	82.8
I feel that my ministry is really appreciated by people	0.5675	0.6671	84.9
I am really glad that I entered the ministry	0.5287	0.6368	89.1
The ministry here gives real purpose and meaning to my life	0.6319	0.7378	78.7
I gain a lot of personal satisfaction from fulfilling my functions here	0.6728	0.7701	83.9
alpha/percent of variance	0.8436	40.0%	

These data confirm the unidimensionality and internal consistency reliability of the two scales, and support the use of the scale scores in further analyses. The two scales of emotional exhaustion in ministry and satisfaction in ministry were quite highly intercorrelated ($r = -.59$, $p < .001$). Correlations of this magnitude indicate that the two constructs are closely related but not synonymous.

Tables 3 and 4 present the mean scores recorded on the Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry and the Satisfaction in Ministry Scale by sex, by age, and by nation. In respect of emotional exhaustion in ministry, these data demonstrate that there was no statistically significant difference between the mean scale scores recorded by male clergy and by female clergy ($t = 1.0$, NS), and that mean scores declined with age. For example, clergy in their fifties recorded a significantly lower mean scale score than clergy in their thirties ($t = 7.1$, $p < .001$). In respect of satisfaction in ministry, these data demonstrate that male clergy recorded a small, but statistically significant, higher level of satisfaction in ministry in comparison with female clergy ($t = 3.2$, $p < .001$), and that there was little relationship between satisfaction in ministry and age.

Table 3 Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry (SEEM):
mean scale scores by sex and age

group	mean	sd	N
sex			
male	14.5	6.5	5496
female	14.3	6.3	1143
age			
20-29	16.5	6.6	102
30-39	16.0	6.5	893
40-49	15.4	6.6	1934
50-59	14.2	6.4	2234
60-69	13.0	5.9	1248
70 plus	11.6	5.6	250
nation			
Australia	13.7	6.5	3903
New Zealand	13.4	6.3	614
England	16.2	6.2	2163

Table 4 Satisfaction in Ministry Scale (SIMS):
mean scale scores by sex and age

group	mean	sd	N
sex			
male	32.6	4.8	5496
female	32.1	4.8	1143
age			
20-29	31.7	5.3	102
30-39	32.3	4.9	893
40-49	32.3	5.1	1934
50-59	32.6	4.8	2234
60-69	32.7	4.5	1248
70 plus	32.7	4.4	250
nation			
Australia	33.2	4.7	3903
New Zealand	32.7	4.6	614
England	31.2	4.8	2163

For example, clergy in their fifties recorded a mean scale score which was not significantly different from that recorded by clergy in their thirties ($t = 1.6$, NS). The comparisons between the three nations demonstrate that the clergy in England recorded significantly higher scores of emotional exhaustion than the clergy in Australia ($t = 14.4$, $P < .001$) and in New Zealand ($t = 9.7$, $p < .001$) and that the clergy in

England recorded significantly lower scores of satisfaction in ministry than the clergy in Australia ($t = 16.0$, $p < .001$) and in New Zealand ($t = 7.3$, $p < .001$).

Table 5 presents the Pearson correlation coefficients between the four scales proposed by the abbreviated Eysenck Personality Questionnaire Revised and the two indices concerned with the work-related psychological health of the clergy: the Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry and the Satisfaction in Ministry Scale.

Table 5 Correlations with Eysenck's dimensions of personality

personality scales	SEEM		SIMS	
	r	p<	r	p<
extraversion	-0.15	.001	+0.24	.001
neuroticism	+0.47	.001	-0.31	.001
psychoticism	-0.03	NS	+0.06	.01
lie scale	-0.10	.001	+0.05	.05

These data demonstrate that personality is a highly significant predictor of individual differences in both emotional exhaustion in ministry and satisfaction in ministry. Among the four Eysenckian scales, neuroticism scores provided the strongest prediction of both emotional exhaustion in ministry ($r = +.47$) and satisfaction in ministry ($r = -.31$). Extraversion scores provided the second strongest predictor of both emotional exhaustion in ministry ($r = -.15$) and satisfaction in ministry ($r = +.24$). Psychoticism scores provided significant prediction of satisfaction in ministry ($r = +.06$) and lie scale scores provided significant prediction of emotional exhaustion in ministry ($r = -.10$). Assuming that the lie scale accesses social conformity, the clergy most susceptible to emotional exhaustion in ministry are the non-conforming neurotic introverts. Assuming that the psychoticism scale accesses toughmindedness, the clergy most likely to enjoy satisfaction in ministry are toughminded stable extraverts.

Discussion

Eight main conclusions emerge from these data.

First, the study has trialed a modified version of the Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry (SEEM) and developed the new Satisfaction in Ministry Scale (SIMS) among male and female church leaders from a variety of denominations in Australia, England and New Zealand. The high alpha coefficients, and other identified scale proper-

ties, confirm the reliability of both scales and commend them for further exploration and testing among clergy from a variety of national and denominational backgrounds. The high negative correlation between the two scales suggest that they access interrelated but not synonymous constructs.

Second, the correlations with sex and age provide further evidence that the two instruments are not merely mirror images of each other, but access somewhat different aspects of clergy work-related psychological health. While there are no significant sex differences on the scale of emotional exhaustion in ministry, the male clergy record a significantly higher level of satisfaction in ministry compared with the female clergy. While there are no significant age differences on the scale of satisfaction in ministry, the younger clergy record higher levels of emotional exhaustion in ministry in comparison with older clergy.

Third, the finding that male clergy and female clergy record comparable levels of emotional exhaustion in ministry is consistent with the findings of Francis, Kaldor, Shevlin and Lewis (2004) in their pioneering study among 4,370 Australian clergy. Francis, Kaldor, Shevlin and Lewis (2004) noted that their findings were contrary to the conclusions of several studies using the Maslach Burnout Inventory among other professional groups which report higher scores on the emotional exhaustion scale among women than among men (BURKE & GREENGLASS, 1989; BYRNE, 1991; VAN DER PLOEG, VAN LEEUWEN & KWE, 1990). They argued, however, that other studies had also demonstrated that personality differences generally well established in the population as a whole between men and women are not found among all clergy, with male clergy following a more feminine profile and female clergy following a more masculine profile (Francis, 1991; Robbins, Francis and Rutledge, 1997). The present study adds further support to the view that generally expected and well established sex differences in the general population may not be routinely replicated among clergy.

Fourth, the finding that younger clergy report higher levels of emotional exhaustion in ministry in comparison with older clergy is also consistent with the findings of Francis, Kaldor, Shevlin and Lewis (2004) among Australian clergy, with the findings of Rutledge and Francis (2004) among male Anglican clergy in England, with the findings of Francis, Loudon and Rutledge (2004) among Roman Catholic parochial clergy in England and Wales, and with findings from studies among a range of other professional groups, including McCarthy (1985), Bartz and Maloney (1986), van der Ploeg, van Heeuwen and Kwee (1990), Byrne (1991), Lee and Ashforth (1991), Jackson, Barnett, Stajich and Murphy (1993), Cook and Banks (1993), and Price

and Spence (1994). The two different theories can be advanced to account for this relationship between emotional exhaustion in ministry and age. The first theory suggests that with age and experience clergy learn how to deal more effectively with the stresses of their ministry and consequently become less susceptible to experiencing emotional exhaustion in ministry (MASLACH, SCHAUFELI & LEITER, 2001). The second theory suggests that clergy most susceptible to emotional exhaustion in ministry will have exited from the profession at a younger age, thus leaving the older cohorts with a higher proportion of clergy who are less susceptible to emotional exhaustion.

Fifth, the comparisons between the three nations demonstrate that there may be significant differences in the experience of ministry between clergy in England on the one hand and clergy in Australia and New Zealand on the other hand. Further research is needed, however, in order to understand the dynamics which lead to these differences.

Sixth, the data demonstrate that, overall, the clergy enjoy a high level of satisfaction with their ministry. Nine out of every ten clergy say that they are really glad that they entered ministry (89%) and that they feel that their pastoral ministry has a positive influence on people's lives (88%). At least eight out of every ten clergy feel that their ministry is really appreciated by people (85%), gain a lot of personal satisfaction from fulfilling their ministry functions (84%), gain a lot of personal satisfaction from working with people (83%), feel that their teaching ministry has a positive influence on people's faith (83%), and believe that they have accomplished many worthwhile things in their ministry (80%). Nearly eight out of every ten clergy say that they feel very positive about their ministry (79%) and that the ministry gives real purpose and meaning to their lives (79%).

Seventh, although the majority of clergy report high levels of satisfaction in ministry, the number who shows some signs of emotional exhaustion in ministry is far from insignificant. Three out of every ten clergy can no longer affirm that they always have enthusiasm for their work (32%). Three out of every ten clergy say that they find themselves frustrated in their attempts to accomplish tasks important to them (31%), that they feel drained in fulfilling their functions (29%), and that fatigue and irritation are part of their daily experience (27%). Almost two out of every ten clergy find themselves spending less and less time with attenders (17%), and say that they are less patient with people than they used to be (16%). At the really sharp end of the emotional exhaustion in ministry scale seven out of every hundred clergy report that they are invaded by sadness they cannot explain (7%), that they feel negative or cynical about the people with whom they work

And others
(below).

(7%), and that they are becoming less flexible in their dealings with attenders (7%). These statistics suggest an unacceptable level of emotional exhaustion in ministry among a group of men and women whose primary pastoral vocation concerns the care of others. The data support the view of the clergy as a happy but exhausted profession.

Eighth, perhaps the most important finding from this study concerns the highly significant correlations between the Eysenckian personality measures and both emotional exhaustion in ministry and satisfaction in ministry. In both cases the two main personality dimensions involved were neuroticism and extraversion. The significant positive correlation between extraversion and satisfaction in ministry and the significant negative correlation between neuroticism and satisfaction in ministry is consistent with the wider research literature which associated positive affect with stable extraversion, as evidenced by the pattern of relationships established between the Eysenckian model of personality and the Oxford Happiness Inventory (see, for example, FRANCIS, BROWN, LESTER & PHILIPCHALK, 1998). The significant negative correlation between extraversion and emotional exhaustion in ministry and the significant positive correlation between neuroticism and emotional exhaustion in ministry is consistent with previous research among clergy reported by Rodgeron and Piedmont (1998) and by Francis and Rutledge (2000) and with previous research among child care workers reported by Manlove (1993). If susceptibility to high levels of emotional exhaustion in ministry and low levels of satisfaction in ministry can be predicted from routine personality testing, church leaders and denominational managers could be in a strong position to identify those individual clergy most vulnerable to suffering the consequences of poor work-related psychological health. Such identification of potential vulnerability could encourage appropriate preventative strategies to be implemented. Preventative strategies could enhance the overall welfare of the clergy and contribute effectively to the wider mission and ministry of the church. Preventative strategies make good economic sense, good pastoral sense, and good theological sense.

Conclusion

The present study has tested two indices concerned with the work-related psychological health of the clergy, one based on positive affect (satisfaction in ministry) and one based on negative affect (emotional exhaustion in ministry) and administered these instruments alongside a standard personality test. Three main conclusions have emerged from these data, one concerned with psychological assessment, one concerned with theoretical development, and one concerned with

practical implications for the pastoral care of the clergy.

At the level of psychological assessment, the two instruments, Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry (SEEM) and Satisfaction in Ministry Scale (SIMS) can be commended for further testing and development in international and inter-denominational research concerned with the work-related psychological health of the clergy. In particular, further research is needed to test the construct validity of the two measures of emotional exhaustion in ministry and satisfaction in ministry and to establish the power of these measures to predict breakdown in clergy health, premature exits from ministry, and early retirement from the clerical profession.

At the level of theoretical development, the suggestion has been advanced that significant variation in susceptibility to high levels of emotional exhaustion in ministry and to low levels of satisfaction in ministry can be predicted from routine personality testing. Further multivariate statistical modelling is now needed to explore the interaction between personality variables and social and contextual factors both in precipitating and in inhibiting high levels of emotional exhaustion in ministry and low levels of satisfaction in ministry. Theory and research of this nature may help to develop church leadership as an evidence-based profession more able to understand and to respond to the stresses of ministry in rapidly changing social contexts, and better equipped to promote work-related psychological health.

At the level of the pastoral care of the clergy, the finding that major dimensions of personality provide good prediction of susceptibility to poor work-related psychological health carries major practical implications for church leaders and denominational managers. If poor work-related psychological health and professional burnout lead to more general psychological and physical health-related problems, if routine psychological testing can identify the individuals most vulnerable to poor work-related psychological health, and if identification of vulnerability could lead to health-enhancing intervention strategies, then church leaders and denominational managers may well be thought to have the responsibility of a proper duty of care to implement such processes of psychological screening and to alert susceptible individuals to appropriate intervention procedures.

References

- ARCHBISHOPS' COUNCIL, 2001, *Generosity and sacrifice: The results of the Clergy Stipends Survey*. London, Church House Publishing.

- BARTZ, C. & MALONEY, J.P., 1986, Burnout among intensive-care nurses, *Research in Nursing and Health*, 9, 147-153.
- BRADBURN, N.M., 1969, *The structure of psychological well-being*. Chicago, Illinois, Aldine.
- BURKE, R.J. & GREENGLASS, E.R., 1989, Psychological burnout among men and women in teaching: An examination of the cherniss model, *Human Relations*, 42, 261-273.
- BYRNE, B.M., 1991, Burnout: Investigating the impact of background variables for elementary, intermediate, secondary and university educators, *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 7, 197-209.
- COOK, B.B. & BANKS, S.R., 1993, Predictors of job burnout in reporters and copy editors, *Journalism Quarterly*, 70, 108-117.
- EYSENCK, H.J. & EYSENCK, S.B.G., 1975, *Manual of the Eysenck Personality Questionnaire (Adult and Junior)*. London, Hodder and Stoughton.
- EYSENCK, H.J. & EYSENCK, S.B.G., 1976, *Psychoticism as a dimension of personality*. London, Hodder and Stoughton.
- EYSENCK, H.J. & EYSENCK, S.B.G., 1991, *Manual of the Eysenck Personality Scales*. London, Hodder and Stoughton.
- FLETCHER, B., 1990, *Clergy under stress: A study of homosexual and heterosexual clergy*. London, Mowbray.
- FRANCIS, L.J., BROWN, L.B., LESTER, D., & PHILIPCHALK, R., 1998, Happiness as stable extraversion: A cross-cultural examination of the reliability and validity of the Oxford Happiness Inventory among students in the UK, USA, Australia and Canada, *Personality and Individual Differences*, 24, 167-171.
- FRANCIS, L.J., BROWN, L.B., & PHILIPCHALK, R., 1992, The development of an abbreviated form of the revised Eysenck Personality Questionnaire (EPQR-A): Its use among students in England, Canada, the USA and Australia, *Personality and Individual Differences*, 13, 443-449.
- FRANCIS, L.J., KALDOR, P., SHEVLIN, M., & LEWIS, C.A., 2004, Assessing emotional exhaustion among the Australian clergy: Internal reliability and construct validity of the Scale of Emotional Exhaustion in Ministry (SEEM), *Review of Religious Research*, 45, 269-277.
- FRANCIS, L.J., LOUDEN, S.H., & RUTLEDGE, C.F.J., 2004, Burnout among Roman Catholic parochial clergy in England and Wales: Myth or reality? *Review of Religious Research*, 46, 5-19.
- FRANCIS, L.J., PENSON, A.W., & JONES, S.H., 2001, Psychological types of male and female Bible College students in England, *Mental Health, Religion and Culture*, 4, 23-32.
- FRANCIS, L.J., ROBBINS, M., LOUDEN, S.H., & HALEY, J.M., 2001, A Revised Psychoticism Scale for the Revised Eysenck Personality Questionnaire: A study among clergy, *Psychological Report*, 88, 1131-1134.
- FRANCIS, L.J. & RUTLEDGE, C.F.J., 2000, Are rural clergy in the Church of England under greater stress? A study in empirical theology, *Research in the Social Scientific Study of Religion*, 11, 173-191.
- FURNHAM, A., 1986, Response bias, social desirability and dissimulation, *Personality and Individual Differences*, 7, 385-400.
- GLASS, J.C. (jnr.), 1976, Ministerial Job Satisfaction Scale, *Review of Religious Research*, 17, 153-157.
- HILLS, P., FRANCIS, L.J., & RUTLEDGE, C.J.F., 2004, The factor structure of a measure of burnout specific to clergy, and its trial application with respect to some individual difference, *Review of Religious Research*, 46, 27-42.
- JACKSON, R.A., BARNETT, C.W., STAJICH, G.V., & MURPHY, J.E., 1993, An analysis of burnout among school of pharmacy faculty, *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, 57, 9-17.
- LEE, R.T. & ASHFORTH, B.E., 1991, Work-unit structure and processes and job-related stresses as predictors of managerial burnout, *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 21, 1831-1847.
- MCCARTHY, P., 1985, Burnout in psychiatric nursing, *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 10, 305-310.
- MCCRAE, R.R. & COSTA, P.T., 1983, Social desirability scales: More substance than style, *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 51, 882-888.
- MANLOVE, E.E., 1993, Multiple correlates of burnout in child care workers, *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 8, 499-518.
- MASLACH, C. & JACKSON, S., 1986, *The Maslach Burnout Inventory* (2nd edition). Palo Alto, California, Consulting Psychologists Press.
- MASLACH, C., SCHAUFELI, W.B., & LEITER, M.P., 2001, Job burnout, *Annual Review of Psychology*, 52, 397-422.
- O'DONOVAN, D., 1969, An historical review of the lie scale: With particular reference to the Maudsley Personality Inventory, *Papers in Psychology*, 3, 13-19.
- OSWALD, R.M., 1991, *Clergy self-care: Finding a balance for effective ministry*. New York, The Alban Institute.
- PARGAMENT, K.I., KENNEL, J., HATHAWAY, W., GREVENGOED, N., NEWMAN, J., & JONES, W., 1988, Religion and the problem-solving process: Three styles of coping, *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 27, 90-104.
- PRICE, L. & SPENCE, S.H., 1994, Burnout symptoms among drug and alcohol service employees: Gender differences in the interaction between work and home stresses, *Anxiety Stress and Coping*, 7, 67-84.
- RODGERS, T.E. & PIEDMONT, R.L., 1998, Assessing the incremental validity of the Religious Problem-Solving Scale in the prediction of clergy burnout, *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 37, 517-527.

- ROSE, M., 1999, Explaining and forecasting job satisfaction: The contribution of occupational profile. Unpublished working paper 2, Department of Social and Policy Sciences, University of Bath.
- RUTLEDGE, C.J.F. & FRANCIS, L.J., 2004, Burnout among male Anglican parochial clergy in England: Testing a modified form of the Maslach Burnout Inventory, *Research in the Social Scientific Study of Religion* (in press).
- SALES, S.M. & HOUSE, J., 1971, Job dissatisfaction as a possible risk factor in coronary heart disease, *Journal of Chronic Diseases*, 23, 861-873.
- STANTON-RICH, H.M. & ISO-AHOLA, S.E., 1998, Burnout and leisure, *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 28, 1931-1950.
- STRÜMPFER, D.J.W. & BANDS, J., 1996, Stress among clergy: An exploratory study on South African Anglican priests, *South African Journal of Psychology*, 26(2), 67-75.
- TURTON, D. & FRANCIS, L.J., 2002, Assessing ministerial job satisfaction: The reliability of the Revised MJSS among male Anglican clergy, *Review of Religious Research*, 44, 169-172.
- VAN DER PLOEG, H.M., VAN LEEUWEN, J.J., & KWEE, M.G.T., 1990, Burnout among Dutch psychotherapists, *Psychological Reports*, 67, 107-112.
- WARNER, J. & CARTER, J.D., 1984, Loneliness, marital adjustment and burnout in pastoral and lay persons, *Journal of Psychology and Theology*, 12, 125-131.

Recensions/Book Reviews

F. Ellen NETTING & James W. ELLOR (Eds.) *Faith-Based Initiatives and Aging Services*, Binghamton, NY, The Haworth Press, Inc., 2004, 165 pages (paperback).

This book is a collection of nine articles co-published with *The Journal of Religious Gerontology* Vol. 16, No. ½ 2004. The focus of this volume is mainly drawn to activities developed over time amongst researchers who worked on Aging services, in coalition with government as well as with faith-based organizations (FBOs) and religious congregations in the United States. It is fitting, thus, that the volume is dedicated to the late Rev. Dr. Donald Clingan who was an ordained minister of the Christian Church and also served as the founding president and first executive director of the National Interfaith Coalition on Aging.

The two editors paid much attention to various areas that constitute Aging services in the United States and the contents of the book are resonated with this careful attention. The book offers many insights. The major part derives from the discussions about historical perspectives on the evolution of the Aging services and they indicate ways in which governmental circumstances made impacts on the crystallization of Aging services. Beginning with the early theological debates in light of a necessity of the separation of church from the State, Ellor provides a broad historical speculation and the discussion concludes with the emergence of Bush's church-state social service initiatives in Texas (Ellor, 2-3 & 12).

With a similar historical tint, but from a slightly different angle, Netting explores how faith-related organizations historically evolved out of different governmental milieu. Netting's article suggests that faith-related organizations are grown out of a form of sectarian firstly and then moved to that of faith-based in between 1700 and 1800 (Netting, 39-40). Then many private charity organizations emerged in between 1870 and 1910, and they are led to the birth of Charity Organization Society (COS). Faith-related organization, now called religious affiliate, is a part of voluntary agency among various non-profit